

The background of the cover is a detailed 19th-century painting of a storm at sea. The sky is filled with heavy, dark, and turbulent clouds, with some light breaking through near the horizon. The sea is dark and choppy, with white-capped waves crashing against a sandy beach in the foreground. Several large sailing ships with multiple masts and sails are visible on the horizon, some appearing to be struggling against the wind. The overall mood is one of intense natural power and maritime drama.

**NINETEENTH-CENTURY EUROPEAN PAINTINGS
AT THE STERLING AND FRANCINE CLARK ART INSTITUTE**

VOLUME ONE

Edited by Sarah Lees

With an essay by Richard Rand
and technical reports by Sandra L. Webber

With contributions by Katharine J. Albert, Philippe Bordes, Dan Cohen,
Kathryn Calley Galitz, Alexis Goodin, Marc Gotlieb, John House,
Simon Kelly, Richard Kendall, Kathleen M. Morris, Leslie Hill Paisley,
Kelly Pask, Elizabeth A. Pergam, Kathryn A. Price, Mark A. Roglán,
James Rosenow, Zoë Samels, and Fronia E. Wissman

Nineteenth-Century European Paintings at the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute is published with the assistance of the Getty Foundation and support from the National Endowment for the Arts.



The Getty Foundation



Produced by the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute
225 South Street, Williamstown, Massachusetts 01267
www.clarkart.edu

Curtis R. Scott, Director of Publications
and Information Resources
Dan Cohen, Special Projects Editor
Katherine Pasco Frisina, Production Editor
Anne Roecklein, Managing Editor
Michael Agee, Photographer
Laurie Glover, Visual Resources
Julie Walsh, Program Assistant
Mari Yoko Hara and Michelle Noyer-Granacki,
Publications Interns

Designed by Susan Marsh
Composed in Meta by Matt Mayerchak
Copyedited by Sharon Herson
Bibliography edited by Sophia Wagner-Serrano
Index by Kathleen M. Friello
Proofread by June Cuffner
Production by The Production Department,
Whately, Massachusetts
Printed on 135 gsm Gardapat Kiara
Color separations and printing by Trifolio, Verona

© 2012 Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute
All rights reserved.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, including illustrations, in any form (beyond that copying permitted by Sections 107 and 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law and except by reviewers for the public press), without written permission from the publishers.

Distributed by Yale University Press, New Haven and London
P. O. Box 209040, New Haven, Connecticut 06520-9040
www.yalebooks.com/art

Printed and bound in Italy
10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute.

Nineteenth-century European paintings at the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute / edited by Sarah Lees ; with an essay by Richard Rand and technical reports by Sandra L. Webber ; with contributions by Katharine J. Albert, Philippe Bordes, Dan Cohen, Kathryn Calley Galitz, Alexis Goodin, Marc Gotlieb, John House, Simon Kelly, Richard Kendall, Kathleen M. Morris, Leslie Hill Paisley, Kelly Pask, Elizabeth A. Pergam, Kathryn A. Price, Mark A. Roglán, James Rosenow, Zoë Samels, Fronia E. Wissman.

volumes cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-935998-09-9 (clark hardcover : alk. paper) —

ISBN 978-0-300-17965-1 (yale hardcover : alk. paper)

1. Painting, European—19th century—Catalogs. 2. Painting—Massachusetts—Williamstown—Catalogs. 3. Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute—Catalogs. I. Lees, Sarah, editor of compilation. II. Rand, Richard. III. Webber, Sandra L. IV. Title. V. Title: 19th-century European paintings at the Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute.

ND457.S74 2012

759.9409'0340747441—dc23

2012030510

Details:

TITLE PAGE: John Constable, *Yarmouth Jetty* (cat. 73)

OPPOSITE COPYRIGHT PAGE: Jean-Baptiste-Camille Corot, *Bathers of the Borromean Isles* (cat. 89)

PAGE VIII: Pierre-Auguste Renoir, *Woman Crocheting* (cat. 267)

PAGE X: Claude Monet, *Seascape, Storm* (cat. 222)

PAGE XII: Jacques-Louis David, *Comte Henri-Amédée-Mercure de Turenne-d'Aynac* (cat. 103)

PAGE XVI: William-Adolphe Bouguereau, *Nymphs and Satyr* (cat. 33)

PRECEDING PAGE 2: Jean-Léon Gérôme, *Snake Charmer* (cat. 154)

easel shown at the Salon of 1870 (fig. 43.2), and in an undated etching of Gonzalès in profile.⁸ Until secure documentation of Gonzalès's travels and friendships in this period is located, the identification must remain conjecture.

It is not known when or where the Clarks purchased the painting, which is not mentioned in Sterling Clark's diaries; the picture was probably acquired after 1941, the year Clark bought Carolus-Duran's *The Artist's Gardener* (cat. 45). KP

PROVENANCE Robert Sterling Clark (until 1955); Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, 1955.

EXHIBITIONS Williamstown 1958a, ill.; Williamstown 1959b, ill.; Williamstown–Hartford 1974, pp. 35–36, no. 14, ill.; Williamstown 1988–89, no cat.

REFERENCES Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute 1963, no. 6, ill.; Weinberg 1991, pp. 193–94, fig. 207; Williamstown 1997b, p. 16, fig. 8; Lille–Toulouse 2003, p. 24.

TECHNICAL REPORT The support is a chamfered mahogany panel 1.6 cm thick with the grain running vertically. The wood has a slightly twisted convex warp noticeable in the upper right corner. The reverse bears a colorman's stamp for Deforge Carpentiers, datable to 1858–69. There are narrow oak strips glued to each edge to center the panel in its frame. Cracks from framing pressure begin in the raised center of the lower edge, and traction crackle occurs in the black areas. Furrows of paint on the left and right edges indicate that a smaller frame was once installed. Scuffs appear on the tops of several impastos, and there is old solvent abrasion above the sitter's ear and the back of her hair. There are losses in the blues and some black strokes of the dress. All four edges are retouched, and in ultraviolet light there are at least three depths of varnish visible on different areas of the surface. The coating on the flesh fluoresces lightly, while the dress has a moderate level, and the top of the hair and areas of the background show a very dense aged natural resin. In 1988, the varnish layers were thinned and the picture was revarnished. Most of the surface is quite shiny, although the lower edge and a repair at the top center edge are matte in reflected light.

The ground is a commercially prepared off-white layer, visible through the red background and thin passages of the costume. Charcoal was detected under magnification along the sitter's nose, and additional outlining of facial features was visible with infrared reflectography. The paint was handled wet-into-wet, using thin to moderately impastoed vehicular strokes. The brushwork is especially lively in the costume. The flesh areas are more carefully worked in small, blended, paste-consistency strokes, which contrast sharply with the rest of the surface.

1. See Lille–Toulouse 2003, p. 99, no. 23a.
2. These include the *Study for Lilia* (1887) in the National Gallery of Art, Washington; see Lille–Toulouse 2003, p. 167, no. 58a.
3. This theme is explored in Paris–New York 2002–3. See also the essay on Carolus-Duran and Spain by Jean-Louis Augé in Lille–Toulouse 2003, pp. 23–26. The relationship between Carolus-Duran and Manet is explored by Sylvie Patry in Lille–Toulouse 2003, pp. 27–36.
4. Alice Hoschedé would become Claude Monet's mistress, and later his wife, after the deaths of their respective spouses.
5. Both paintings are now in private collections. The portrait of Alice Hoschedé was sold at Sotheby's, New York, 3 May 2000, no. 277. For the portrait of Marthe Hoschedé, see Distel 1990, p. 98, fig. 82.
6. Manet's portrait of Carolus-Duran is in the Barber Institute of Arts, University of Birmingham. Two portraits of Manet by Carolus exist, one in a private collection and the other in the Musée d'Orsay, Paris; both are reproduced in Lille–Toulouse 2003, pp. 140–41. Earlier sources erroneously date these portraits to 1875 rather than 1876.
7. Tabarant 1947, p. 294: "Notre voisin de campagne."
8. For another photograph of Eva Gonzalès, see Sainsaulieu and Mons 1990, p. 7. The irregularity of Gonzalès's features and Manet's unidealized depiction of them in his much-criticized portrait of her are discussed by Garb 2007, pp. 76–79.

44 | View in the Lower Church of San Francesco in Assisi 1876

Oil on panel, 17.5 x 28.4 cm
 Gift of the Joseph F. McCrindle Collection
 2009.12.3

The painting depicts the west wall of the north transept of the Lower Church of the Basilica of San Francesco in Assisi, looking west.¹ At the center of the composition is the short stone staircase leading up to a small landing; the curve of the low barrel-vaulted ceilings is more pronounced at the top of the stairs at the upper right of the painting. The alcove contains a large door leading from the Lower Basilica to the Cloister of Sixtus IV. The fresco visible at the left is one of a series depicting the life of Saint Francis that has been attributed to the workshop of Giotto. The decoration of the transept was carried out in three phases beginning about 1300,



44

possibly to coincide with the centenary of the saint's death in 1326;² the particular scene recorded here has been dated to about 1313.³ It shows Francis bringing back to life a boy who has fallen from a balcony, one of the miracles attributed to the founder of the Franciscan order. The artist's rendition of the fresco is loose and summary, and the key detail of the falling boy has been excluded. An inscription in French on the back of the panel documents the general subject ("Assise,") and a specific date ("11 mars 1876"), presumably the day the picture was made.

The small panel entered the collection from the estate of Joseph F. McCrindle carrying an attribution to Carolus-Duran. This attribution has been endorsed by Annie Scottez de Wambrechies,⁴ but the date inscribed on the reverse requires clarification. Carolus-Duran was in Paris on 11 March 1876 (his third child having been born two days earlier), and was planning a journey to Saint Petersburg, Russia, for the spring of that year. He thus cannot have been at the Basilica of San Francesco on 11 March and, in fact, had most likely not been in Italy at all during the previous decade. The possibility remains that the work was painted in his Paris studio from a sketch the artist had made during an earlier trip to Italy.

In 1860, the young Carolus-Duran had been awarded the Wicar Prize, which allowed him to travel to Italy for an extended period between 1862 and

1866. While there, the artist stayed at the Convent of Saint Francis in Subiaco, located halfway between Rome and Assisi. Little else is known about his extended stay in Italy aside from the fact that it also included visits to Rome and Venice. It is possible that at some point during his stay, Carolus-Duran traveled to Assisi in order to see the basilica. This visit would have provided him with the visual material, in the form of a sketch or possibly only a memory, for the subject of this painting.

Stylistically, the oil sketch is reminiscent of several other small works executed by Carolus-Duran during the 1870s also exhibiting a loose yet descriptive style of painting. These include *Glory, or Memory of the Siege of Paris* (1870; private collection), *Montgeron. Corner of the House* (c. 1877; private collection), and *Henri Regnault Dead on the Battlefield* (c. 1871–1900; Palais des Beaux-Arts, Lille).⁵ Similar to the church interior, these three works exhibit a careful attention to framing, color choice, and efficient brushwork. The last painting in particular provides an apt comparison to the Assisi sketch because it also relies on the artist's own memory to depict past events, in this case the death of fellow artist Henri Regnault while they both were serving in the French National Guard during the Franco-Prussian war (1870–71). Around the time of the Saint Francis painting, Carolus-Duran won a commission to paint a ceiling in the Palais de Lux-

embourg, Paris, entitled the *Glorification of Marie de Médicis* (1878; now in the Musée du Louvre, Paris). The painting's classical setting may have prompted Carolus-Duran to revisit his work from his time in Italy. The Assisi oil sketch may have also been a preparatory painting for a larger-scale work that was never realized. 25

PROVENANCE Joseph F. McCrindle, New York and London (d. 2008); Joseph F. McCrindle Estate, New York (2008–9, given to the Clark, as *Entrance to a Crypt*, attributed to Carolus-Duran); Sterling and Francine Clark Art Institute, 2009.

EXHIBITIONS None

REFERENCES None

TECHNICAL REPORT The support is a mahogany panel 0.5 cm thick, with the grain running horizontally. The painting is done on the raw wood of the back, chamfered side of the board. There is a shallow splinter loss in the upper left corner. The reverse is covered in choppy strokes of thick, grimy off-white paint, which seems to have been applied by the artist. There is a graphite inscription on the reverse, along with two round blue stamps reading “Gabriel Ferrier” with a star at the base of the circle. The panel is slightly convex overall and the chamfers' inner edges were scored into the wood at about 2.5 cm from all four sides. There are several old dents in the surface, and the raw wood grain is evident in various passages, particularly the staircase. The top center and lower edges have no paint, possibly suggesting that the panel was held by some sort of clip device during painting. Black sooty grime was removed from the surface in 2011, along with yellowed natural resin varnish. Heavier deposits of varnish on the right half of the image, probably original resin, were thinned. There is almost no inpainting.

There is no ground layer. The use of the reverse of a chamfered panel is unusual. The wood grain's irregular texture is used to enhance the lightly scumbled paint strokes. There was no underdrawing detected, although it appears that the staircase was painted first and the dark background areas were laid in afterward. The color palette is limited, and most brushstrokes are primarily dry scumbles with some impastos.

1. Bonsanti 2002, vol. 1, p. 633, shows a photographic view similar to the one depicted in the Clark's painting.

2. Lunghi 1996, pp. 114–15.

3. Bonsanti 2002, vol. 1, p. 548.

4. Correspondence, 3 Dec. 2010. See the Clark's curatorial file.

5. See Lille–Toulouse 2003, pp. 100, 138, for reproductions of *Glory, or Memory of the Siege of Paris* and *Montgeron. Corner of the House*.

45 | The Artist's Gardener 1893

Oil on canvas, 81.6 x 54.8 cm

Upper left: Carolus-Duran; upper right: St Aygulf, Obre 1893
1955.40

As noted in the discussion of *Spanish Woman* (cat. 43), Carolus-Duran's highly finished portraits of fashionable female sitters brought him great success. A portrait of his wife, usually called *Lady with a Glove* (Musée d'Orsay, Paris), shown at the Salon of 1869, initiated this phase of his career. Carolus also painted portraits of men from all ranks of society, many of which offer a less formal and more intimate view of the sitter than his portraits of women. Such is the case with the subject of the present painting, who was likely chosen as a sitter by the painter as a sort of antidote to the costumed formality of most of his commissioned portraits. Here a somber workingman, forthright and frank, gazes outward assuredly. His arms are crossed, his lips locked, and he wears a wrinkled overcoat. The man sports unruly locks of dark hair, the movement of which contrasts with the tightness of his body and expression. The palette of the painting is subdued and restricted, consisting of earth tones punctuated only by a hint of light blue in the sitter's shirt. The portrait was quickly and loosely painted and gives the impression that the sitter was loathe to rest from his labors for long. In these aspects, the painting is akin to Carolus-Duran's portrait of the Norwegian artist Frits Thaulow of 1890 (Oslo Bymuseum). It was painted in just three days, according to the critic Léopold Mabileau, who went on to describe it as a frank and manly work delivered in a quick and dirty manner.¹ Similar words could apply to *The Artist's Gardener*, and are perhaps even more appropriate given the subject.

According to its inscription, Carolus executed this painting in the town of Saint-Aygulf in October 1893.² Carolus acquired property in Saint-Aygulf, on the French Riviera, in 1883, and in the early 1890s, he and his family spent part of each autumn in a sumptuous villa he had built there.³

Just three months after its completion, this painting was exhibited in Paris, where it was touted as being among the best works that the artist had ever shown.⁴ At the exhibition, the sitter was identified as a gardener in the employ of Carolus-Duran. Either at this exhibition or soon thereafter, the painting caught the eye of